What would be required to reduce health inequalities?

Testing the fundamental causes theory in Scotland

Sonya Scott
Gerry McCartney
“Of all inequalities, injustice in health is the most shocking and inhumane”

Martin Luther King
Inequalities in male mortality (early 2000s, all ages)

Sources: Mackenbach (2008) and Popham (2010)
Inequalities in female mortality (early 2000s, all ages)

Sources: Mackenbach (2008) and Popham (2010)
Causes of health inequalities

- Health inequalities are caused by socioeconomic differences
- Mediated by direct material circumstances, health behaviours, culture etc.
- Phelan & Link argue that they can not be eliminated unless the ‘fundamental causes’ are tackled (inequality in income, power & wealth)
- Theory suggests that reduced exposure to mediators (e.g. tobacco) will not eliminate inequalities as other mechanisms will intervene
Theoretical Model of Substitution
Aims

To test the Fundamental Causes theory by:

1. Examining whether health inequalities change when income inequality changes (using existing data)
2. Testing whether new cause specific health inequalities arise when others decline (substitution)
3. Testing whether the most preventable conditions exhibit the largest inequalities
Methods

- Review long-term trends in mortality and income for GB inequality from literature
- Age standardised mortality rates (ASMR)
  - Men and women, all ages, Carstairs deciles
  - Men 20-64 years, social class
- Slope (SII) and Relative (RII) Indices of Inequality
- ASMR aggregate avoidable and non-avoidable
- SII and RII for 4 preventability categories as per ONS categorisation
Slope Index of Inequality (SII) and Relative Index of Inequality (RII)

**SII** = notional gap between top and bottom of distribution – absolute difference

**RII** = SII divided by mean – relative difference

**Diagram:**
- The vertical axis represents the mortality rate.
- The horizontal axis represents the cumulative ranked population.
- The graph illustrates the comparison between the most affluent and least affluent groups.
- The SII is shown as the notional gap between the two groups.
- The RII is calculated as the SII divided by the mean, representing the relative difference.
Results 1: Do health inequalities vary with income inequalities?
Mortality gap between local authorities and income inequalities in GB 1921-2007
(Sources: Thomas & Dorling 2010, IFS 2012)
Results 2: Do new causes of health inequalities appear as others diminish?
Declining Absolute Inequalities Women

Decreasing absolute inequalities for women across Carstairs deciles in Scotland 1983-1999

- Diabetes mellitus
- Rheumatic and other valvular heart disease
- Hypertensive disease
- Homicide/assault
- TB

Slope index of inequality (5-year centred moving average)
Declining Relative Inequalities Women

Decreasing relative inequalities for women across Carstairs deciles in Scotland 1983-1999

Relative index of inequality (5-year centred moving average)

- Homicide/assault
- TB
- Rheumatic and other valvular heart disease
- Hypertensive disease
- Diabetes mellitus

© NHS Health Scotland
Declining Absolute Inequalities Men

Decreasing absolute inequalities for men across Carstairs deciles in Scotland 1983-1999

Slope index of inequality (5-year centred moving average)

- Rheumatic and other valvular heart disease
Declining Relative Inequalities Men

Decreasing relative inequalities for men across Carstairs deciles in Scotland 1983-1999

Relative index of inequality (5-year centred moving average)

- Rheumatic and other valvular heart disease
Emergence of inequalities 1:

HIV/AIDS: Female age standardised mortality within Carstairs Deciles

Age standardised mortality rate per 100,000 per year (5-year moving average)
Emergence of Inequalities 2:

Complications of the perinatal period: mortality within Carstairs Deciles

Age standardised mortality rate per 100,000 per year (5-year moving average)
Emergence of Inequalities 3:

Colorectal Cancer: mortality within social class for men aged 20-64 years

[Diagram showing age-standardised mortality rates per 100,000 per year for different social classes from 1976 to 1999.]
Emergence of Inequalities 4:

Malignant melanoma: mortality within social class for men aged 20-64 years
Results 3: Do the most preventable causes display the greatest health inequalities?
Avoidability 1:

Mortality by deprivation for avoidable & non-avoidable causes of death for women
Avoidability 2:

Mortality by deprivation for avoidable and non-avoidable causes of death for men
Avoidability 3:

Mortality by social class avoidable and non-avoidable causes of death for men aged 20-64 years
Relative inequalities in mortality by preventability of cause of death
Discussion

• Evidence in support of fundamental causes theory
  – Mortality inequalities rise & fall with income inequalities
  – Reducing mortality inequalities for some causes is counterbalanced by rises in others
  – Preventable causes have greater inequalities

• Strengths - Comprehensive data; predetermined exposure and outcome measures; use of both individual and area based measures.

• Weaknesses - Limits of current knowledge; small number of non-avoidable causes; social class numerator-denominator mismatch, descriptive analysis only
Conclusions

• Focusing on controlling single risk/disease will not eradicate all-cause inequalities.

• Need to reduce inequalities in income, power and wealth or efforts to eliminate health inequalities are likely to fail.
Acknowledgements and References

Thanks to:
Esther Curnock, Debbie McLaren, Rachel Mc Nelis Rory Mitchell, Mark Robinson, Elaine Tod (Health Scotland); Frank Dixon and David Shelton (National Records for Scotland).

Key references:


- Mackenbach JP. What would happen to health inequalities if smoking were eliminated? BMJ 2011; 342:d3460.

Contact: sonyascott@nhs.net